

## UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

| APPLICATION NO.                                               | FILING DATE     | FIRST NAMED INVENTOR | ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.     | CONFIRMATION NO |
|---------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|----------------------|-------------------------|-----------------|
| 10/723,659                                                    | 11/25/2003      | Peter James Dunn     | PC10383B                | 8807            |
| 28523                                                         | 7590 08/18/2004 |                      | EXAMINER                |                 |
| PFIZER INC. PATENT DEPARTMENT, MS8260-1611 EASTERN POINT ROAD |                 |                      | MCKENZIE, THOMAS C      |                 |
|                                                               |                 |                      | ART UNIT                | PAPER NUMBER    |
| GROTON, C                                                     |                 |                      | 1624                    |                 |
|                                                               |                 |                      | DATE MAILED: 08/18/200- | 4               |

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

|                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Application No.                                                                                                                                                                               | Applicant(s)                                                                                             |  |  |  |  |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| Office Action Summary                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | 10/723,659                                                                                                                                                                                    | DUNN ET AL.                                                                                              |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Examiner                                                                                                                                                                                      | Art Unit                                                                                                 |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    | - WAN INC DATE AND A STATE OF THE STATE OF T | Thomas McKenzie, Ph.D.                                                                                                                                                                        | 1624                                                                                                     |  |  |  |  |
| Period fo                                                                          | The MAILING DATE of this communication apports reply                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | pears on the cover sneet with the (                                                                                                                                                           | correspondence address                                                                                   |  |  |  |  |
| THE - Exte after - If the - If NO - Failt Any                                      | MORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPL'MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION. ensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.1 or SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication. Preply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a repl of period for reply specified above, the maximum statutory period ourse to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing the patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be tingly within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) day will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from a cause the application to become ABANDONE | mely filed ys will be considered timely. n the mailing date of this communication. ED (35 U.S.C. § 133). |  |  |  |  |
| Status                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| 1)⊠                                                                                | Responsive to communication(s) filed on 25 N                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | lovember 2003.                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| 2a) <u></u>                                                                        | ☐ This action is <b>FINAL</b> . 2b) ☐ This action is non-final.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| 3)                                                                                 | Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    | closed in accordance with the practice under Ex parte Quayle, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| Disposit                                                                           | ion of Claims                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| 4) 🗆                                                                               | Claim(s) 17-45 is/are pending in the applicatio                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | n.                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| ,                                                                                  | 4a) Of the above claim(s) is/are withdrawn from consideration.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| 5)□                                                                                | 5) Claim(s) is/are allowed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| , <u> </u>                                                                         | ☐ Claim(s) 17-43 is/are rejected.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    | Claim(s) <u>44 and 45</u> is/are objected to.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| •                                                                                  | Claim(s) are subject to restriction and/o                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | or election requirement.                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| Applicat                                                                           | ion Papers                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    | The specification is objected to by the Examine                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | <u>ar</u>                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| 10) The drawing(s) filed on is/are: a) accepted or b) objected to by the Examiner. |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| 10)                                                                                | Applicant may not request that any objection to the                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    | Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correct                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| 11)                                                                                | The oath or declaration is objected to by the Ex                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| -                                                                                  | under 35 U.S.C. § 119                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                               | ) (d) (f)                                                                                                |  |  |  |  |
| · ·                                                                                | Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign  ☐ All b)☐ Some * c)☐ None of:  1.☐ Certified copies of the priority document                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                               | )-(a) or (t).                                                                                            |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    | 2. Certified copies of the priority document                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                               | ion No. 09/886,269.                                                                                      |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    | 3. Copies of the certified copies of the prior                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    | application from the International Bureau                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| * (                                                                                | See the attached detailed Office action for a list                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | of the certified copies not receive                                                                                                                                                           | ed.                                                                                                      |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| Attachmer                                                                          | •                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                    | ce of References Cited (PTO-892)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | 4)                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                          |  |  |  |  |
| 3) 🔯 Infor                                                                         | ce of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)<br>mation Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)<br>er No(s)/Mail Date <u>11/25/03</u> .                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                               | Patent Application (PTO-152)                                                                             |  |  |  |  |

Art Unit: 1624

#### **DETAILED ACTION**

1. This action is in response to an application filed on 11/25/03. There are twenty-nine claims pending and twenty-nine under consideration. Claims 38-45 are compound claims. Claims 17-37 are method of making claims. This is the first action on the merits. The application concerns some processes of making Sildenafil and intermediates therefor.

#### **Priority**

2. The status of non-provisional parent application should also be included. Since the parent application has become a patent, please update the first line of the specification with the expression "now Patent No. 6,667,398" following the filing date of the parent application.

### Claim Objections

- 3. Claim 27 is objected to under 37 CFR 1.75(c) as being in improper form because a multiple dependent claim because reference to two sets of claims to different features is not permitted. See MPEP § 608.01(n). The Examiner suggests adding the structure of compound VA.
- 4. Claim 28 is objected to under 37 CFR 1.75(c) as being in improper form because a multiple dependent claim because reference to two sets of claims to different features is not permitted. See MPEP § 608.01(n). The Examiner suggests adding the structure of compound VD.

Application/Control Number: 10/723,659 Page 3

Art Unit: 1624

5. Claim 29 is objected to under 37 CFR 1.75(c) as being in improper form because a multiple dependent claim because reference to two sets of claims to different features is not permitted. See MPEP § 608.01(n). The Examiner suggests adding the structure of radical R<sup>d</sup>.

- 6. Claim 31 is objected to under 37 CFR 1.75(c) as being in improper form because a multiple dependent claim because reference to two sets of claims to different features is not permitted. See MPEP § 608.01(n). The Examiner suggests adding the structure of radicals A, G, and R<sup>3</sup>.
- 7. Claim 35 is objected to under 37 CFR 1.75(c) as being in improper form because a multiple dependent claim because reference to two sets of claims to different features is not permitted. See MPEP § 608.01(n). The Examiner suggests adding the structure of compound VII.
- 8. Claim 38 is objected to because of the following informalities: It is a compound claim, yet it depends upon a method claim. Appropriate correction is required. The Examiner suggests adding the structure of compound II.

#### Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 112

9. The following is a quotation of the second paragraph of 35 U.S.C. 112:

The specification shall conclude with one or more claims particularly pointing out and distinctly claiming the subject matter which the applicant regards as his invention.

Art Unit: 1624

Claims 17 and 26 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which applicant regards as the invention. Throughout these claims, Applicants use the term "general formula". This is indefinite because it implies more than one formula is claimed. The Examiner suggests deleting the word "general".

- 10. Claims 17-40 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which applicant regards as the invention. Concerning formula II, in claims 17 and 26, Applicants have the limitation, "wherein R<sup>X</sup> is a group substitutable by an aminopyrazole". In the passage spanning line 21, page 9 to line 11, page 10, Applicants provide an open definition of this term. In addition to the radicals listed in the passage discussed, what else is being claimed? The Examiner suggests either listing the claimed radicals or amending the specification to make clear what is being claimed.
- 11. Claims 17-25, 30, 31, and 41 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which applicant regards as the invention. Concerning formula IV, Applicants have the limitation, "G represents \*\*\* or a derivative thereof." In the passage spanning line 21, page 11 to line 16, page 12, Applicants

Art Unit: 1624

provide an explanation, using open terms, of which derivatives they intended. In addition to the radicals listed in the passage discussed, what else is being claimed? The word "derivatives" is indefinite for we do not know which compounds are contemplated. A derivative is the result of a reaction upon an organic molecule. Since we do not know the reagents or the conditions of these reactions, there is no way of determining the structures of the claimed "derivatives". The phrase "derivatives thereof" is, in essence, a product by process claim. Yet Applicants have not described the intended processes sufficiently that we may understand the structures of the compounds they claim. Webster's New World Dictionary defines derivative as "a substance derived from ... another substance by chemical change", and "substitution of one or more elements or radicals for one or more constituents of the original substance" has occurred. All implying that new chemical bonds have formed. The Examiner suggests either listing the claimed derivatives or amending the specification to make clear what is being claimed.

12. Claims 17-25 and 30-37 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which applicant regards as the invention. In the final two lines of claim 17, Applicants have the limitation, "with an appropriate reagent for converting the group G to a -C(RX)=NH group". In the passage spanning line 17,

Art Unit: 1624

page 12 to line 4, page 16, Applicants give examples of such reagents using the open term "for example". In addition to the reagents listed in the passage discussed, what else is being claimed? The Examiner suggests either listing the claimed radicals or amending the specification to make clear what is being claimed.

- 13. Claims 26-29 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which applicant regards as the invention. In the final line of claim 26, Applicants have the limitation, "with a reagent that will convert one RX group to another". In the passage spanning line 6, page 16 to line 14, page 17, Applicants give examples of such reagents using the open term "for example". In addition to the reagents listed in the passage discussed, what else is being claimed? The Examiner suggests either listing the claimed radicals or amending the specification to make clear what is being claimed.
- 14. Claim 31 is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which applicant regards as the invention. In the final line of the claim, "with a reagent that may be used for the introduction of a SO<sub>2</sub>L<sup>1</sup> group into an aromatic or heteroaromatic ring system". In the passage spanning line 19, page 18 to line 25,

Art Unit: 1624

page 18, Applicants give examples of such reagents using the open term "for example". In addition to the reagents listed in the passage discussed, what else is being claimed? The Examiner suggests either listing the claimed radicals or amending the specification to make clear what is being claimed.

# Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

15. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless -

(b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.

Claim 41 is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by Dunn (EP 812,845 A1, cited by Applicants). The compound (V) fits formula (IV) with A = CH,  $R^3 = ethyl$ ,  $G = CO_2H$ , and  $R^4 = methyl$ . It is found in the scheme on page 5 of the reference. Compound (II) on the same page also anticipates as a derivative of the claimed carboxylic acid.

16. Claim 41 is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by Johnson (Synlett). The compound shown below fits formula (IV) with A = CH,  $R^3 = methyl$ , G = bromine, and  $R^4 = methyl$ . A bromine atom attached to a benzene ring may be converted to a carboxylic acid by exchange with butyl lithium and reaction with  $CO_2$ . Conversely, a bromine atom attached to a benzene ring may be prepared from a carboxylic acid by a Hunsdiecker reaction. Thus, it is a "derivative". It has

Art Unit: 1624

registry number 215187-22-7 and is found in the Table 1 on page 1025 of the reference. Compound 11 was prepared from this substance. Although the reference does not tell how the bromo compound was prepared, there is no doubt Johnson (Synlett) possessed the compound shown. The compound 11 in the reverence, with A = CH,  $R^3 = methyl$ , G = N-(BOC)-pyrrol-2-yl, and  $R^4 = methyl$  also anticipated applicants' claim since for all the Examiner knows, a pyrrolyl group is also a "derivative" of  $CO_2H$ .

17. Claims 41-43 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by Bunnage (WO 99/54333 A1). The compound shown below fits formula (IV) with A = N,  $R^3 = R^4 = \text{ethyl}$ , and  $G = CO_2H$ . It has registry number 247582-73-6 and is found in lines 10-24, page 127 of the reference. The ethyl ester is found in lines 1-9, page 125. Thus, claim 43 is anticipated.

Art Unit: 1624

### Allowable Subject Matter

18. Claims 44 and 45 are objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims. Claims 17-40 would be allowable if rewritten to overcome the rejection(s) under 35 U.S.C. 112, 2nd paragraph, set forth in this Office action and to include all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims.

#### Conclusion

- 19. Information regarding the status of an application should be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at (866) 217-9197 (toll-free). Please direct general inquiries to the receptionist whose telephone number is (703) 308-1235.
- 20. Please direct any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the Examiner to Thomas C McKenzie, Ph. D. whose telephone number is (571) 272-0670. The FAX number for amendments is (703)

Art Unit: 1624

872-9306. The PTO presently encourages all applicants to communicate by FAX. The Examiner is available from 8:30 to 5:30, Monday through Friday. If attempts to reach the Examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, please contact James O. Wilson, acting SPE of Art Unit 1624, at (571)-272-0661.

Patent Examiner

Art Unit 1624

TCMcK/me